

**MINUTES OF THE  
PUBLIC EDUCATION APPROPRIATIONS SUBCOMMITTEE**

Wednesday, November 8, 2017 • 9:00 a.m. • 445 State Capitol

**Members Present:**

Sen. Lyle W. Hillyard, Senate Chair  
Rep. Daniel McCay, House Chair  
Rep. Robert M. Spendlove, House Vice Chair  
Sen. J. Stuart Adams  
Sen. Lincoln Fillmore  
Sen. Jani Iwamoto  
Sen. Ann Millner  
Sen. Jerry W. Stevenson  
Rep. Patrice M. Arent  
Rep. Joel K. Briscoe  
Rep. Steve Eliason  
Rep. Justin L. Fawson  
Rep. Jefferson Moss

Rep. Susan Pulsipher

**Members Absent:**

Sen. Howard A. Stephenson  
Sen. Daniel W. Thatcher  
Rep. LaVar Christensen  
Rep. Francis D. Gibson  
Rep. Bradley G. Last  
Rep. Karianne Lisonbee  
Rep. V. Lowry Snow

**Staff Present:**

Mr. Ben Leishman, Fiscal Analyst  
Karen C. Allred, Committee Secretary  
Mr. Sean C. Faherty, Fiscal Analyst

Note: A copy of related materials and an audio recording of the meeting can be found at [www.le.utah.gov](http://www.le.utah.gov).

Chair McCay called the meeting to order at 9:08 a.m.

Chair McCay excused Sen. Thatcher, Rep. Christensen, Rep. Lisonbee, Rep. Snow and Rep. Gibson from this meeting. He stated that agenda item 3, would be the first item discussed today and that the last item in this agenda item, "the Performance Audit of the Utah State Board of Education (USBE) "Aspire" Student Information System" would not be presented today because the State Board has determined to not implement changes to the Aspire program.

3c-A Performance Audit of USBE's Aspire Student Information [LAG]

[3c-A Performance Audit of USBE's Aspire Student Information \[LAG\]](#)

**1. Audit Reviews**

Mr. Darin Underwood, Deputy Auditor General, introduced Mr. Wayne Kidd, Audit Supervisor, Office of Legislative Auditor General (OLAG), and . Mr. Ryan Thelin, Auditor, OLAG. Mr. Kidd explained an audit review of Public Education Federal Grants.

3a-A Limited Review of Public Education Federal Grants [LAG]

[3a-A Limited Review of Public Education Federal Grants \[LAG\]](#)

Mr. Underwood asked to hear a response from the State Board.

Mr. Scott Jones, Deputy Superintendent of Operations, USBE, gave a response to the audit and stated that the State Office is effectively managing the grants.

Mr. Underwood introduced Mr. Matthew Harvey, Audit Supervisor, OLAG. Mr. Harvey gave a presentation on the audit review of the STEM Action Center.

3b-A Limited Review of The STEM Action Center [LAG]

[3b-A Limited Review of The STEM Action Center \[LAG\]](#)

Rep. Arent, Rep. Briscoe, Rep. Pulsipher, Sen. Iwamoto, and Sen. Milner, asked questions about the STEM Action Center, with responses from Mr. Harvey, Mr. Underwood and Ms. Tami Goetz, Executive Director, STEM Action Center.

Sen. Hillyard assumed the chair.

Rep. Briscoe and Sen. Hillyard asked questions concerning the STEM program with responses from Ms. Goetz.

Rep. McCay assumed the chair.

Chair McCay and Sen. Hillyard made comments concerning the STEM action center and asked that the STEM action center be discussed in an early meeting during the session. Ms. Goetz responded to his comment.

## **2. Performance Measures**

Mr. Ben Leishman, Fiscal Analyst, gave an overview of performance measures passed by the Legislature during the 2017 General Session.

2a-Performance Measures Brief - June 2017

[2a-Performance Measures Brief - June 2017](#)

2b-Draft Statewide P-20 Goals and Outcome Metrics

[2b-Draft Statewide P-20 Goals and Outcome Metrics](#)

2c-MSP Performance Measures - HB2 to P-20

[2c-MSP Performance Measures - HB2 to P-20](#)

Dr. Sydney Dickson, State Superintendent, USBE, introduced Dr. Jill Curry, Fiscal Policy Analyst, USBE, and they gave a presentation on recommendations for performance measures for the upcoming Legislative Session.

2d-Performance Measures [USBE]

[2d-Performance Measures \[USBE\]](#)

Rep. Briscoe and Rep. Fawson, asked questions and made comments, with responses from Superintendent Dickson, Dr. Curry and Sen. Millner.

Sen. Hillyard assumed the chair.

Sen. Hillyard, Rep. Eliason, Rep. Arent, and Rep. Pulsipher made comments.

Rep. McCay resumed the chair.

Dr. Curry continued with her presentation.

Rep. Fawson asked about trauma informed practices training, with a response by Superintendent Dickson. Dr. Curry continued with her presentation.

Rep. Briscoe asked questions about proposed performance measures, with responses from Dr. Curry, Superintendent Dickson, and Mr. Leishman. Chair McCay made a comment concerning keeping performance measures in perspective, with a response from Superintendent Dickson. Rep. Pulsipher and Sen. Millner, asked questions with a response from Dr. Curry and Superintendent Dickson. Dr. Curry continued her presentation.

Rep. Fawson asked a question about initiative programs, with a response from Superintendent Dickson. Dr. Curry continued her presentation.

Chair McCay asked about the Utah Schools for the Deaf and the Blind, with a response from Superintendent Dickson. Dr. Curry continued with her presentation.

Rep. Fawson asked about line items with no proposed measures, with a response from Mr. Leishman. Dr. Curry and Mr. Leishman continued with the presentation of School Building Programs.

Superintendent Dickson summarized the recommendations that had been presented. Sen. Millner, Mr. Leishman and Chair McCay made comments on performance measures, and Superintendent Dickson responded.

### **3. Break**

Chair McCay announced a 5 minute break.

Chair McCay resumed the meeting.

### **4. Special Education Teacher Salary Supplement**

Rep. Val Potter introduced Ms. Victoria Ashby, Associate General Council, Office of Legislative Research and General Counsel, and they gave a presentation on the Special Education Teacher Salary Supplement and a bill to expand all teacher's salary.

5a-Handout on Teacher Salary Supplement [Potter]

[5a-Handout on Teacher Salary Supplement \[Potter\]](#)

Rep. Arent, Rep. Eliason, Rep. Briscoe, Rep. Pulsipher, Rep. Fawson, Sen. Hillyard, and Chair McCay, asked questions and made comments about the bill to expand teacher salary with a response from Rep. Potter.

## **5. Critical Languages & Dual Immersion**

Mr. John Dougall, State Auditor, introduced Hollie Andrus, Audit Director, State Auditor's Office, and Bertha Lui, Senior Audit Manager, State Auditor's Office. Ms. Andrus gave a presentation on a Dual Language Immersion Program audit report, with comments from Mr. Dougall.

6a-Critical Languages and Dual Immersion

[6a-Critical Languages and Dual Immersion](#)

Sen. Hillyard assumed the chair.

Sen. Hillyard and Rep. Fawson asked questions concerning this audit, with responses from Ms. Andrus and Mr. Dougall.

Superintendent Dickson reported on procedures the State Board has put into place in response to the audit.

Sen. Hillyard and Rep. Eliason, asked a question concerning the result of the audit and Mr. Scott Jones, Deputy Superintendent, USBE, responded.

Rep. McCay resumed the chair.

## **6. Early Intervention Reading Program**

Ms. Sarah Young, Digital Teaching and Learning Coordinator, USBE, introduced Dr. John Hobbs, External Evaluator, Evaluator and Training Institute. Ms. Young gave a presentation on the Early Intervention Reading Program.

Rep. Arent, Rep. Briscoe, Sen. Adams, Sen. Hillyard, Rep. Pulsipher, and Sen. Millner, asked questions and Chair McCay made a comment, concerning the presentation, with responses from Ms. Young and Dr. Hobbs.

## **7. Lunch Break**

Chair McCay announced a 20 minute lunch break.

Chair McCay reconvened the meeting.

## **8. Required Bill & Intent Language Reports**

Dr. Jones gave a report on School Level Reporting and House Bill 331, from the 2016 General Session, requirements.

9a-Legislative Report - School Level Reporting [USBE]

[9a-Legislative Report - School Level Reporting \[USBE\]](#)

Sen. Stevenson, Rep. Pulsipher, Chair McCay, and Sen. Hillyard, made comments, and had questions on school level reporting, with responses from Dr. Jones and Ms. Jaime Barrett, Minimum School Program Administrator, USBE.

Mr. Jones gave an introduction to the presentation, and Superintendent Dickson gave a presentation on Intent Language--Regulatory vs. Support Functions, as a result of Senate Bill 2, "Public Education Budget Amendments", from the 2016 General Session.

9b-Senate Bill 2 Intent Language Report [USBE]

[9b-Senate Bill 2 Intent Language Report \[USBE\]](#)

Sen. Hillyard assumed the chair.

Rep. McCay resumed the chair.

Rep. Arent asked about administrative pay with a response from Superintendent Dickson.

## **9. Break**

Because of time restraints, there was no break.

## **10. Property Tax Equalization**

Mr. Leishman gave an overview of current property tax equalization programs in the state education budget. Sen. Fillmore discussed a concept for the 2018 General Session to expand equalization efforts within the Voted & Board Local Levy Programs.

Chair McCay asked Sen. Fillmore to elaborate on the item "the funding equity is up to the Legislature to solve". Sen. Fillmore responded to that request and then continued with his presentation.

Rep. Briscoe, Sen. Millner, and Chair Hillyard, Sen. Adams, Rep. Pulsipher asked questions and made comments concerning property tax equalization.

Sen. Hillyard assumed the Chair.

#### **11. Budget Deep Dives: MSP Related to Basic School Programs**

Mr. Leishman gave an overview of budget information, issues and recommendations for Flexible Allocation, Class Size Reduction, and Early Intervention programs.

12a-Flexible Allocation

[12a-Flexible Allocation](#)

Rep. McCay resumed the chair and reported to the subcommittee and public that agenda item 12 is currently being discussed. Mr. Leishman continued with his presentation.

12b-Class Size Reduction

[12b-Class Size Reduction](#)

Sen. Iwamoto and Rep. Pulsipher, asked a question about class size, with a response from Mr. Leishman and Sen. Hillyard. Mr. Leishman continued his discussion.

12c-Early Intervention

[12c-Early Intervention](#)

Sen. Hillyard and Rep. Briscoe made comments on early intervention, with a response from Mr. Leishman.

#### **12. Subcommittee Discussion & Recommendations**

**MOTION:** Sen. Hillyard moved to recommend that the Executive Appropriations Committee exclude the following programs from the initial FY 2019 Public Education Base Budget. Further, he moved that the funding associated with these programs remain part of the subcommittee allocation for the 2018 General Session to allow the subcommittee to determine how funds will be distributed and how effective measurements of each program can be implemented in the FY 2019 budget. The programs include: Pupil Transportation Unsafe Routes - \$500,000; Educator Salary Adjustments - \$171,089,400; Matching Fund for School Nurses - \$1,002,000; K-3 Reading Improvement - \$15,000,000; Flexible Allocation - \$7,788,000; Class Size Reduction - \$135,449,700; and Early Intervention - \$7,500,000. He moved to direct staff to work with the subcommittee chairs

Public Education Appropriations Subcommittee

November 8, 2017

Page 7

to develop scenarios to include the associated funding in the Weighted Pupil Unit Value while mitigating the first-year (FY 2019) distributional impacts among local education agencies.

**SUBSTITUTE MOTION:** Rep. Briscoe moved to amend by adding Early Intervention Software Program - \$7,600,000 to the previous motion. The Substitute motion passed with a vote of 10-1-10.

Yeas-10

Rep. P. Arent  
Rep. J. Briscoe  
Rep. J. Fawson  
Sen. L. Hillyard  
Sen. J. Iwamoto  
Sen. A. Millner  
Rep. J. Moss  
Rep. S. Pulsipher  
Rep. R. Spendlove  
Sen. J. Stevenson

Nays-1

Rep. D. McCay

Absent-10

Sen. J. Adams  
Rep. L. Christensen  
Rep. S. Eliason  
Sen. L. Fillmore  
Rep. F. Gibson  
Rep. B. Last  
Rep. K. Lisonbee  
Rep. V. Snow  
Sen. H. Stephenson  
Sen. D. Thatcher

Rep. Briscoe, Rep. Arent, Sen. Hillyard, Ms. Tami Pfiffer, Governor's Office, Superintendent Dickson, and Chair McCay, spoke to the motion.

**MOTION:** Sen. Hillyard moved to approve the minutes. The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-10.

Yeas-11

Rep. P. Arent  
Rep. J. Briscoe  
Rep. J. Fawson  
Sen. L. Hillyard  
Sen. J. Iwamoto  
Rep. D. McCay  
Sen. A. Millner  
Rep. J. Moss  
Rep. S. Pulsipher  
Rep. R. Spendlove  
Sen. J. Stevenson

Nays-0

Absent-10

Sen. J. Adams  
Rep. L. Christensen  
Rep. S. Eliason  
Sen. L. Fillmore  
Rep. F. Gibson  
Rep. B. Last  
Rep. K. Lisonbee  
Rep. V. Snow  
Sen. H. Stephenson  
Sen. D. Thatcher

Chair McCay commented that no formal action was taken on the performance measures. The performance measures that are in the base budget now, will stay in the budget. Sen Milner commented that the performance measures by the State Board are an improvement, and would like to use them as a starting point.

Public Education Appropriations Subcommittee

November 8, 2017

Page 8

**MOTION:** Sen. Hillyard moved to replace the performance measures put in last year's base budget with the performance measures proposed by the USBE, heard today, with the understanding that the Education Standing Committee, which will meet next week, that Sen. Milner, who is a Co-Chair of that committee, with the State Board, will work to come up with further changes to be ready for the General Session in January 2018. The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-10.

Yeas-11

Rep. P. Arent  
Rep. J. Briscoe  
Rep. J. Fawson  
Sen. L. Hillyard  
Sen. J. Iwamoto  
Rep. D. McCay  
Sen. A. Millner  
Rep. J. Moss  
Rep. S. Pulsipher  
Rep. R. Spendlove  
Sen. J. Stevenson

Nays-0

Absent-10

Sen. J. Adams  
Rep. L. Christensen  
Rep. S. Eliason  
Sen. L. Fillmore  
Rep. F. Gibson  
Rep. B. Last  
Rep. K. Lisonbee  
Rep. V. Snow  
Sen. H. Stephenson  
Sen. D. Thatcher

Sen. Millner spoke to the motion.

**13. Other Business**

There is no other business.

**MOTION:** Sen. Millner moved to adjourn.

Chair McCay adjourned the meeting at 3:25 p.m.